

3.0 PERSONNEL AND HUMAN RESOURCES

3.0 PERSONNEL AND HUMAN RESOURCES

The Bath County Public School's (BCPS) management of personnel and human resources is reviewed in this chapter. The chapter is divided into the following four sections:

- 3.1 Organization and Management
- 3.2 Job Descriptions
- 3.3 Employment of Personnel
- 3.4 Employee Compensation

CHAPTER SUMMARY

BCPS is a small school division with just a little over 160 employees and three schools. The office of instruction and personnel, which oversees all instructional and personnel services has done exceeding well in providing and maintaining services to its teachers and employees considering the number of responsibilities that this office undertakes. They are applauded for their work and devotion toward improvement of services. The office has implemented several initiatives to improve its professional development, its mentorship program, and its recruitment initiatives, which are all commendable and include:

- a survey of teachers to assess the types of professional development activities and programs that will best meet their needs;
- strengthening of its mentorship program piloted last school year; the creation of a mentorship training program called BEST (Beginning Educator Support and Training), and surveying mentors and mentorees to bring further improvements to the program; and
- increasing its efforts to recruit high quality teachers to BCPS in light of upcoming teacher retirements over the next five years.

However, there are areas of personnel operations that are in need of improvements in order to maintain a sound system of personnel and human resources management. Several areas are covered in this chapter and include such functions as:

- assistance needed in delivering personnel services;
- production of more timely and encompassing personnel reports to assist and support decisions that are to be made by central office administrators;
- delivery of a customer feedback survey;
- development of strategies and long-range plans for recruitment efforts; and
- reduction of teacher absences.

3.1 Organization and Management

The office of instruction and personnel is responsible for the oversight of instruction and personnel services. The instruction side of this office oversees the supervision of elementary and secondary education. The personnel side is responsible for:

- directing personnel recruitment;
- conducting new hire orientation;
- managing licensing and re-licensing of staff;
- administering the sick bank committee;
- hiring and training substitute teachers; and
- coordinating staff development activity.

The office is accountable for providing and maintaining a sound system of personnel and human resources management that complies with the Commonwealth of Virginia laws and is consistent with Bath County Public Schools' mission and policies

FINDING

The office of instruction and personnel that oversees the supervision and management of instruction and the delivery of personnel services is minimally staffed resulting in ineffective personnel practices.

A director oversees this office with the assistance of a secretary. In addition to the specific responsibilities for the delivery of personnel services as previously noted, the director is responsible for the delivery and supervision of:

- SOA/SOQ compliance;
- division testing;
- curriculum development;
- resource materials and textbooks;
- federal programs;
- gifted education program;
- family life education;
- Adult Basic Education;
- GED as the chief examiner;
- library media services;
- grant applications;
- state accreditation;
- summer school planning and administration; and
- home-school coordination.

Some additional oversight responsibilities of the director include attendance reports, internal investigations, school board policy development, and state/local reports.

The office of instruction and personnel is undertaking an excessive amount of responsibilities that depend on a staff of two to administer. When BCPS staff was interviewed prior to the MGT on-site review, several interviewees mentioned that this

particular office was understaffed for the two major functions that the office is assigned to manage.

The secretary is responsible for all clerical, bookkeeping, and accounting requirements associated with personnel and instruction. A list of duties of the secretary is shown in Exhibit 3-1.

**EXHIBIT 3-1
SECRETARY TO THE DIRECTOR
OFFICE OF PERSONNEL AND INSTRUCTION
DUTIES AND RESPONSIBILITIES**

Responsible for preparing, ordering, providing, overseeing and/or assisting the director with:

- adoption samples, orders, and distribution of textbooks;
- curriculum support;
- instructional materials;
- orientation of new hires, substitute teachers, and preschool workdays;
- job postings, advertisements, applications, applicant correspondence;
- background checks and health screenings;
- new hire report
- licensure workshop(s)
- licensure applications, certificate renewals, upgrades, name changes
- employee recognition of service and retirements
- substitute lists
- personnel directory
- personnel evaluation forms
- personnel files
- registrations for recruitment job fairs
- information packets and display materials for recruitment
- policy updates
- attendance reports
- ordering paper
- office Xerox machines
- filing
- director correspondence
- answering telephone

Source: Derived from a list of responsibilities of Central Office Secretaries provided by the Bath County Public School Division, April 2006.

The personnel function in school systems has a much larger role than ever before in the operation of the division because of the intense competitiveness of teacher recruitment, the importance of effective and accurate job descriptions, licensing and re-licensing of certified staff, staff development, and compensation. Several of these functions are neglected due to the minimally staffed office. Within this chapter some of these functions for sound personnel management are discussed and recommendations made.

RECOMMENDATION

Recommendation 3-1:

Employ a coordinator in the Office of Instruction and Personnel to provide assistance in carrying out responsibilities for the effective management of personnel and human resources services.

MGT recommends that a coordinator be hired to supervise the delivery of personnel services that in turn will relieve some of the oversight responsibilities of the director and administrative duties of the secretary.

The coordinator should be responsible for oversight of job descriptions, personnel records, certification/re-certification, personnel procedures, employee handbook, applicant and hiring processes, coordinating new employee induction and orientation, tracking evaluations, personnel forms, developing reports, and other personnel functions as assigned by the director. The person selected for the position should have some experience in human resources and have at least a bachelor’s degree, preferably masters.

A job description should be developed for the position, the position posted by January 2007, and a person hired no later than July 2007.

FISCAL IMPACT

Since BCPS does not maintain an administrator salary schedule, the consultant relied on the review of administrative salaries that are currently in place. Those positions include directors, central office administrator, business manager, and school administrators. No coordinator position exists. The salary range for current administrative positions is from a low of \$40,000 to a high of \$68,000. Thus to determine a coordinator salary, the consultant fixed a salary of \$40,000, but this amount will eventually be dependent upon the outcome of implementation of Recommendation 3-2, if adopted, which calls for the development of an administrative salary schedule.

The 2007-08 cost could be \$50,800 - base salary of \$40,000 plus \$10,800 in benefits (27 percent). The total cost through 2010-11 could be \$203,200.

Recommendation	2006-07	2007-08	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11
Employ a Coordinator of Personnel	\$0	(\$50,800)	(\$50,800)	(\$50,800)	(\$50,800)

FINDING

BCPS does not maintain easily accessible and effective personnel data for creating reports, resulting in a lack of quality information for the division to make informed decisions.

The consultant discovered in the process of analyzing data provided by the division that the data was not summarized, explained well, or was inefficiently and ineffectively captured. A request was made for a list of employee salaries but that information was captured in another requested report on employee absences over the past three years. The absentee data for the current year was presented on several spreadsheets according to schools and central office employees with salaries added at the end of each employee absentee record.

Teacher absenteeism could not be extracted easily from the spreadsheet as no title was given for each employee. The absentee record was formatted in the spreadsheet in such a way that the data could not be disaggregated for the number of absences due to sick, personal, and/or administrative leave. Nor could totals be accurately run for the number of days teachers were "absent from duty" since other employees were scattered throughout the spreadsheet.

Reports on teacher turnover, staff absences, employee salaries, and other pertinent personnel data cannot be easily captured to create reports or maintain historical data.

Accurate personnel data reporting to the school board, superintendent, staff, and community is necessary for the successful operation of the division. Divisions that can easily and accurately pull up current and historical data for analysis have in place systems that allow accurate reporting.

RECOMMENDATION:

Recommendation 3-2:

Review personnel data quarterly for accuracy and timeliness and revise reports to make available to executive staff information in an understandable format.

Concerted efforts to carefully review personnel and salary data should be made and effective summary reports should be created for the superintendent, executive staff, and auditors. Regular reviews of data should be scheduled. The office of instruction and personnel need the capacity to pull up data to create accurate reports. Historical data should be maintained to use for current comparisons.

FISCAL IMPACT

This recommendation does not have a fiscal impact but will require time and effort of staff to produce reports for analysis of data in making personnel decisions for the office of instruction and personnel or for the division.

FINDING

BCPS does not have a process in place to survey staff to evaluate the quality of services provided by the division.

The last survey was conducted in December of 2000 at which time employees and parents were surveyed. The Virginia Association of School Superintendents conducted a review of the division at that time, which included surveying staff and parents in

relationship to the strengths of the division, areas for improvement, and priorities that the school board and administration should address.

Feedback from employees can assist a school division in the delivery of more effective services. For example, a survey can answer questions like, “are employees satisfied with the division operations (the hiring process, for instance)”, “the placing of substitutes”, “personnel information delivered to employees”, “central office response time”, and a host of other services?”

Finding out from employees what they find valuable and what they do not can assist staff in redeveloping or refining the way in which they provide services. A customer satisfaction survey can help to accomplish this and provide valuable input for senior managers.

MGT found that this would be particularly valuable, as there appears to be some morale issues among teachers and dissatisfaction in the community in regards to division operations. MGT staff witnessed this during the public hearing that was held while staff was on-site for the efficiency review. Only by hearing from staff can the division take steps to rectify and resolve issues that affect the division and its mission.

RECOMMENDATION

Recommendation 3-3:

Develop and implement an employee feedback system to assist central office administrators and staff in evaluating the quality of its services and promoting improvement.

The office of instruction and personnel should undertake the responsibility to design a staff survey that focuses upon a series of questions designed to elicit feedback from employees (and possibly parents and the community) on division services including:

- What went well in 2005-06 in staffing and other services provided by the division?
- What services should be improved or changed?
- What are the expectations for employee relations?
- What suggestions are given for improving services to schools and employees?

Survey results should be used as a means for central office to evaluate performance both from an internal perspective as well as through its primary customers—the employees of Bath County Public Schools.

FISCAL IMPACT

This recommendation can be accomplished without a fiscal impact to the division. For staff, the office of instruction and personnel recently conducted an on-line professional

development needs assessment survey of teachers. Seventy-six (76) of 82 teachers responded. The on-line survey used Microsoft's SharePoint. The division has the means to distribute such a survey without incurring any expense.

3.2 Job Descriptions

Well-written job descriptions are necessary for effective personnel management. Job standards for particular types of jobs are set when a description of a job is clearly stated, and the assignment of pay grades is more easily accomplished when a job description has all the necessary components. Job descriptions clarify performance expectations and can serve as a basis for annual performance evaluations. More importantly, job descriptions are important in defending workers' compensation and civil lawsuits.

FINDING

BCPS has no process for reviewing and updating job descriptions of the job descriptions available, very few show any indication of the date the job description was last reviewed.

In 2003, BCPS purchased generic job descriptions from the Virginia School Board Association (VSBA). At that time, the division was interested in updating descriptions and upon recommendation of the director of instruction and personnel, the school board voted to use the VSBA service. The VSBA provided the division generic descriptions for numerous types of positions, which are easily adapted to fit any position within the division. However, since 2003, only four BCPS job descriptions were updated using the generic description as template and guide. The revised job descriptions are well developed, structured, and dated.

However, other than the four that were provided, the remaining descriptions are not updated and no date is indicated if and when they ever have been. Regularly planned reviews are not conducted. Moreover, there is a variance in structure, components, and style. However, almost all pertinent data are included such as:

- title;
- qualifications;
- direct supervisor;
- job goal;
- major functions/performance responsibilities;
- terms of employment; and
- evaluation criteria.

The job descriptions do not include a date as to when they were developed or revised, nor do they include other pertinent information such as:

- school board action, if any;
- prepared by;
- approved by;
- work location name;
- telephone number; and
- personnel office review (with date).

Job descriptions require updating on a regular basis to make certain that they reflect the current status of the position. Since BCPS has no regularly scheduled review and no date listed on a majority of their descriptions, MGT could not determine if a job description was pertinent to the current responsibilities undertaken by the person now holding the position.

York County School Division in Virginia maintains well structured complete, and comprehensive job descriptions and has established an update process on a three-year cycle and could be used as a model.

RECOMMENDATION

Recommendation 3-4:

Revise and update all BCPS job descriptions and establish a process for updating job descriptions every three years.

A full review of all BCPS job descriptions should be conducted. A systematic review of all essential functions should be made. The structure, content areas, and style already in use for the four descriptions previously mentioned should be duplicated and dated. Each employee should be provided with a copy.

Once all current job description are reviewed and dated, a procedure should be established by the office of instruction and personnel for reviewing and updating job descriptions on a three-year cycle with one-third of the job descriptions reviewed each year. Maintaining updated job descriptions should provide an effective tool for communicating expectations to current and prospective employees.

The updating, editing, and revision of job descriptions, overseen by the director of instruction and personnel, should be conducted and completed in the first several months of the 2006-07 school year.

FISCAL IMPACT

This recommendation will not fiscally impact the division but will required time and effort on the part of all administrators and supervisors in the division. Administrators and supervisors should be given the responsibility for updating staff positions that report to them. The director of instruction and personnel should develop, oversee the process, and assume responsibility for the completion of the efforts.

3.3 Employment of Personnel

To fulfill Bath County Public Schools' mission ... *to meet the educational needs of our diverse student population with the highest standards possible, and to be the schools of choice for Bath County citizens* in maintaining a highly qualified workforce is a necessity. Recruiting, employing, and retaining such a workforce is the responsibility of the office of instruction and personnel. Within this section, the recruitment and employment of staff is analyzed.

Fortunately for BCPS, the division has been able to hire teachers to fill vacancies that have occurred each year without the difficulty that many other school systems across the nation are experiencing. However, the division is about to face a larger number of teachers that may retire in the next few years and the division will begin to experience the intense competition among school systems to recruit and retain teachers, especially attracting teachers who are new or unfamiliar with a rural setting. Thus, the recruitment and retention of a highly qualified professional staff at Bath County Public Schools is the primary issue that is likely to drive the operations of the office of instruction and personnel in the foreseeable future.

According to records furnished by the office of personnel, there are 164 full-time employees in the school division. Of this number, half (82) are instructional staff (includes teachers, guidance counselors and librarians). Three percent of the total employees are central office administrators. Forty-four percent are support staff (nurses, paraprofessionals, secretaries, maintenance, custodians, bus drivers, and food service workers). Exhibit 3-2 details the number of employees according to administrators, instructional staff, and support staff.

Exhibit 3-3 shows the number of teachers who resigned, retired, and were terminated over the past two school years and those that have resigned and retired during the current school year (2005-06) up through April 2006. The exhibit also shows the turnover percentage rate for each of the school years listed in the exhibit.

The total number of resignations, terminations, and retirements stayed the same in 2003-04 and 2004-05, but decreased by almost four percentage points in 2005-06. However, more than likely the number of teachers retiring and resigning in 2005-06 will increase over the next few months as figures for this year only include those teachers who have informed the division of their decision to resign or retire up through April 2006. The turnover rate for 2003-04 and 2004-05 is high at 12 percent and 2005-06 turnover rate may be just as high or higher than those years when the division learns of the new retirements and resignations prior to the end of the 2005-06 school year.

Exhibit 3-4 provides the years of experience of BCPS teachers.

Over 25 percent of BCPS teachers have 20 or more years of teaching experience and have the option of retiring in the next five years. Almost 30 percent of teachers are relatively new to teaching with up to three years of teaching experience. Of those 24 teachers with 0-3 years of service, almost half (11) are first year teachers. Both present problems to the division – how to retain those first to third year teachers and how to find teachers to replace those that are retiring. BCPS will increasingly face intense competition among school systems in hiring the most qualified staff. BCPS will be competing against divisions that offer incentives that BCPS will find hard to match. Thus, BCPS is faced with developing strategies that will attract prospective teachers to a mostly rural area.

**EXHIBIT 3-2
BATH COUNTY PUBLIC SCHOOLS
NUMBER OF EMPLOYEES
2005-06 SCHOOL YEAR**

EMPLOYEE GROUP	NUMBER EMPLOYEES	SCHOOLS		
		MES	VES	BCHS
ADMINISTRATORS				
Central Office Administrators				
Superintendent	1	1	1	1
Directors	2			1
Administrator	1			
Business Manager	1			
Sub-total	5			
School Based Administrators				
Principals	3			
Assistant Principals	1			
Sub-total	4			
Total Administrators	9			
INSTRUCTIONAL STAFF				
Teachers	75	17	26	32
Guidance Counselors	3	1	1	2
Librarians	3	1	1	1
Total Instructional Staff	81			
SUPPORT STAFF				
Nurses	1		1	
Paraprofessionals	20	7	6	7
Secretaries	10	1	2	3
Maintenance Supervisor	1			
Custodians	9	2	3	4
Transportation				
Transportation Supervisor	1			
Bus Garage	2			
Bus Drivers	16	4	5	7
Food Service Workers	13	3	5	5
Total Support Staff	73			
GRAND TOTAL	163	37	51	63

Source: Bath County Public Schools, Office of Instruction and Personnel, April 2006.

¹ Supervisors of Maintenance and Transportation

**EXHIBIT 3-3
BATH COUNTY PUBLIC SCHOOLS
TEACHER TURNOVER
2003-04, 2004-05, 2005-06**

YEAR	RESIGNATIONS			TERMINATIONS			RETIREMENTS			TOTAL PER YEAR	TOTAL TEACHERS	TURNOVER RATE
	MES	VES	BCHS	MES	VES	BCHS	MES	VES	BCHS			
2003-04	0	2	3	0	0	0	0	4	1	10	82	12.2%
2004-05	1	2	2	1	0	0	1	2	1	10	82	12.2%
2005-06 ¹	0	1	1	0	0	0	0	0	5	7	82	8.5%

Source: Bath County Public Schools, Office of Instruction and Personnel, April 2006.

¹ Resignations, Terminations, and Retirements up through April 2006.

**EXHIBIT 3-4
BATH COUNTY PUBLIC SCHOOLS
TEACHERS
YEARS OF SERVICE**

YEARS OF SERVICE	NUMBER OF TEACHERS	PERCENTAGE
0-3 years ¹	24	29.3%
4-9 years	21	25.6%
10-14 years	4	4.9%
15-19 years	11	13.4%
20-24 years	7	8.5%
25-29 years	9	11.0%
30 plus years	6	7.3%
Total Teachers	82	

Source: Bath County Public Schools, Office of Instruction and Personnel, April 2006.

¹ Of the 24 teachers with three years or less of experience, 11 are first year teachers at BCPS

FINDING

Bath County Public Schools does not have a comprehensive teacher recruitment plan, program, or strategies. Such a program is vital to meet the increasing teacher vacancies that the division will experience as teachers retire.

According to an Educational Services Review Study by the Virginia Association of School Superintendents (VASS) in December of 2000, a survey of staff indicated that one of the areas that respondents felt needed improvement was to “*recruit more assertively*”. BCPS has made effort to do this over the past several years. Exhibit 3-5 provides an overview of 2005-06 recruiting efforts.

Additional efforts include advertising in local newspapers and attendance at a job fair at James Madison University. The division’s Web site provides information about job openings, teacher salary ranges, application for download, and some information about the division.

**EXHIBIT 3-5
BATH COUNTY PUBLIC SCHOOLS
RECRUITING EFFORTS
2005-06**

RECRUITMENT EFFORT	DESCRIPTION
The Governor's Great Virginia Teach-In	A recruiting and information fair designed for teachers considering a career move to Virginia, students enrolled in teacher preparation programs, liberal arts students considering teaching as a career, and professionals in other fields who have a desire to teach
Teach in Virginia	A recruitment initiative of the Virginia Department of Education. Provides both licensed and non-licensed teacher candidates in high-need subject areas the ability to apply to multiple divisions throughout the Commonwealth. Candidates are screen for eligibility and quality before being sent on to partner school divisions. BCPS was chose as one of 60 partner school divisions for the 2005-06 school year.
Teachers-Teachers.com	Teachers seeking teaching positions access this internet site and create an online resume with the help of a <i>resume builder</i> . The resume is posted online for schools across the county to view.
Teachers @ Work	A nationwide online database that matches the professional staffing needs of schools with teacher applicants who can fill those positions and provides an efficient and economical way to overcome the geographical limitations of recruitment.
Western Virginia Public Education Consortium	A consortium of 19 divisions, of which BCPS is a member. The division pays a membership fee of \$1,000 to belong to the consortium. A job fair is held annually.

Source: Information provided by Bath County Public Schools, Office of Instruction and Personnel, April 2006.

The division offers few special hiring incentives to candidates. In the past two years, the school board has granted two requests from new employees for a salary advance as a no-interest loan. Recruiting has not been a major problem in the past because of the low number of vacancies; however, it is a concern now due to the number of teachers that will be retiring within the next five years.

Little documentation was provided in regards to recruitment other than overviews of planned recruitment activities presented to the school board over the past several years. Two pages of teacher recruitment activities for 2005-06 and 2006-07 were reviewed, but both were identical. No review of these activities with such information as number of teachers interviewed at job fairs, applications received during the year, an assessment of recruitment activities was provided. Since the number of teachers hired has been relatively small, the division has not felt it necessary to record this type of information. However, divisions that experience teacher shortages effectively maintain documented evidence of efforts, annual reports, and have a plan or program for recruitment.

RECOMMENDATION

Recommendation 3-5:

Develop a long-range plan including recruitment strategies.

BCPS should develop strategies for recruiting teachers. These strategies should be outlined in a recruitment plan/program that includes a mission statement, goals, action plans, implementation and tracking of activities, statistical data, an annual assessment, and year-end report to the superintendent and school board.

State trends should be carefully analyzed and contacts made with as many state universities as possible to develop alliances. With the addition of a personnel coordinator as recommended in Section 3.1 of this chapter, some duties of the secretary and the director will be freed up to assist more with other initiatives. All administrative staff should be involved as well as the superintendent in making contacts and participating in recruitment trips.

Consideration should be given to early contracts, moving allowances, monetary bonuses, and interest free loans. Reactivation of the division's educational foundation within a focus on developing funds as well as soliciting help from the Chamber of Commerce or developing partnerships with area businesses to assist in these efforts.

Perhaps a high school student or an instructional staff member with video experience could produce a DVD/CD video of the division and surrounding area to provide prospective candidates. The Teachers for Tomorrow program sponsored by the state to support school divisions in cultivating an effective "grow your own" recruitment program might be implemented by creating a high school curricular experience designed to foster student interest, understanding, and appreciate of the teaching profession.

The Director of Instruction and Personnel should begin to closely track and observe teacher terminations, retirements, and turnover trends. Other administrators should be solicited to help in developing a recruitment plan. Once the plan is developed, the director should present it to the superintendent for final approval and then to the school board.

FISCAL IMPACT

Putting together a recruitment plan and developing strategies should involve approximately four to eight hours of staff time and the cost cannot be estimated until the plan is developed.

FINDING

Little or no monetary incentives are provided to teacher candidates to teach in BCPS. Providing monetary incentives to candidates is restrictive because of budgetary restraints. However, to attract teachers to a rural setting without the appeal of a large school division, they are a necessity. Lack of housing, social outlets, living in a rural area, and inclement weather could be considered deterrents in attracting younger

teacher candidates to the area. The beauty and small town atmosphere of the area offers somewhat of a balance to some seeking employment.

However, offering monetary incentives is made more difficult when current recruitment funds are limited and a good portion goes to advertising, Western Virginia Public Education Consortium membership fees, and recruitment trips expenses.

Somerset County Public Schools in Maryland, (a relatively small school system but with three times the student population of BCPS) has budgeted over \$50,000 toward recruitment efforts such as traveling expenses for the candidate, production of a DVD/CD, and moving expenses for new hires. This is a large budget, but one the division found necessary to recruit to this largely rural area. Not many small divisions can afford such incentives, but school systems are finding incentives necessary to compete in the market place for attracting teachers to their districts.

RECOMMENDATION

Recommendation 3-6:

Provide a monetary incentive to newly hired teachers.

The division should consider providing some type of monetary incentive to attract teachers to the area. Under consideration should be incentives such as traveling expenses, moving costs, first month rental fees, rental deposits, or early signing bonuses. The amount provided should not be excessive and dependent on the number of teachers hired, but something that will cause candidates to take notice and consider teaching in BCPS.

FISCAL IMPACT

MGT recommends that \$10,000 be earmarked in the recruitment budget for incentives to attract candidates to BCPS. The way the monies will be distributed will depend on the strategies developed for recruitment as recommended in the previous recommendation and the number of candidates offered positions in the division.

Recommendation	2006-07	2007-08	2008-09	2009-10	2010-11
Provide a Monetary Incentive to Newly Hired Teachers	(\$10,000)	(\$10,000)	(\$10,000)	(\$10,000)	(\$10,000)

FINDING

The process of providing annual contracts to non-certified staff is an unnecessary work process. Each non-certified staff member receives an annual contract that is signed by the employee and the superintendent. The contract is not binding on the individual or division as one of the conditions of the contract states that *...if either party desires to terminate this contract before the close of the contract period, said party must give two (2) weeks written notice....* A sample copy is shown in Exhibit 3-6.

BCPS policy (*Section G: Personnel, Policy GCPS*) states that contracts shall be issued to all certificated personnel except if temporarily employed as a substitute teacher. The consultant evidenced no local policy that non-certificated employees should be issued a contract. This practice is not a requirement of state or federal statutes as such employees are hired at-will.

Currently, there are 72 non-certified employees in the division. The process to issue contracts to each employee entails inserting the staff name, position, school year, and salary into the contract. The contract is then delivered to the employee, who must sign and return to the Office of Instruction and Personnel and await signature from the superintendent. A copy is returned to the employee. The contract is filed with all other contracts for that year and finally placed in the employee's personnel file.

Division staff reported that employees want to have these contracts to ensure they are hired for the upcoming school year and that it provides a sense of comfort to the employee to receive one. This practice has endured for many years in the division. Years ago this entailed intensive staff labor when a name, position, salary was hand typed into the contract. However, the use of computers has reduced this labor-intensive work. Nonetheless, the time that it takes to even enter the information that is required, to print out the contract, deliver it, have the employee and superintendent sign, and return it is not warranted. The time is better spent for other responsibilities such as those associated with the last two recommendations for increased efforts in recruitment.

MGT consultants have seldom seen this practice used in any of their performance reviews.

RECOMMENDATION

Recommendation 3-7:

Discontinue the practice of providing contracts to non-certified employees.

The division should provide employment contracts only when required by law and when necessary to hire and retain key personnel in strategic positions. This recommendation should reduce time spent by staff in administering such contracts.

The director of instruction and personnel with the approval of the school board and superintendent should inform non-certified employees that they will not be issued an annual contract but only a notification of assignment, reassignment, and salary.

FISCAL IMPACT

This recommendation can be implemented without a fiscal impact and with existing resources.

**EXHIBIT 3-6
BATH COUNTY PUBLIC SCHOOLS
SAMPLE CLASSIFIED EMPLOYEE CONTRACT**

ANNUAL CONTRACT WITH CLASSIFIED PERSONNEL - 12 MONTH

SECRETARY

THIS ARTICLE OF AGREEMENT, between the **SCHOOL BOARD OF BATH COUNTY**, as party of the first part and, _____, party of the second part.

WITNESSETH, party of the first part agrees to employ and the party of the second part agrees to accept employment in the position of: **SECRETARY**, subject to the authority of the party of the first part, under the supervision and direction of the Superintendent, and agrees to the following conditions, **to wit**:

- 1) Said party of the second part shall perform such duties during the period of this contract as are deemed necessary for efficient and successful operation of the school system.
- 2) Hours: The employee will be assigned an eight hour work day with one-half hour for lunch included. (The employee may take one hour for lunch for a total work day of eight and one-half hours.) Work hours will be assigned by the Superintendent or Principal.
- 3) Vacation: Refer to the adopted school calendar and School Board Policy GCBD/GDBD-R. Individual vacation dates shall be at a time mutually satisfactory to the party of the second part, the immediate supervisor, and Division Superintendent.
- 4) Sick Leave: one (1) day per month, accumulative to seventy (70) days.
- 5) Salary: Party of the first part agrees to pay said party of the second part \$ _____ for school year **200 -0**), beginning **July 1, 200** through **June 30, 200** in **24** installments or until date of termination.
- 6) If either party desires to terminate this contract before the close of the contract period, said party must give two (2) weeks written notice. Failure of the party of the second part to do so will forfeit any pay which might otherwise be due. Payment will be on the basis of total number of days worked to date of termination.
- 7) **SPECIAL COVENANTS:**
5% Employee's V.R.S. paid

IN WITNESS WHEREOF, the parties hereunto have set their hands and seal this **th** day of **June, 200** .

Party of the Second Part

Division Superintendent/Clerk of the Board

Source: Bath County Public Schools, Human Resource Department, 2006.

FINDING

BCPS does not have an effective process (or exit interview instrument) to analyze why employees leave the division. The division has in use a one-page exit interview form with general questions such as:

- What are your reasons for ending employment?
- What did you like most about your assignment?
- What did you like least about your assignment?
- How could your school be improved to help students?

The exit interview form is too general and tabulating results is time consuming. Staff were unable to verify whether principals even use the form, and/or if it is used, if it is returned to central office.

Currently, a departing employee is asked to come before the school board in a closed session to discuss reasons for departure. This process has little value other than allowing a departing employee to vent frustration, which most likely is not going to happen, or to expound on reasons that are either unsound or provide little insight into why the person might really be leaving. Appearing before the school board is left up to the individual. No records are maintained or tabulated to provide the division with an analysis of departure with which to develop retention strategies.

Exhibit 3-7 provides an example of an effective exit interview questionnaire that is used in Stevens Point Area Public School District in Wisconsin.

RECOMMENDATION

Recommendation 3-8:

Ensure that every employee departing BCPS completes an exit interview; track reasons for departure; and annually report the findings to the superintendent and school board.

The Director of Instruction and Personnel should develop a comprehensive exit survey that each departing employee will be asked to complete upon departure. Results from the survey should be maintained in a database for tracking purposes and used in developing retention strategies. At the end of each school year, a report should be presented to the superintendent and the school board encompassing termination statistics, results from the exit survey, teacher turnover, strategies for teacher retention and an evaluation of strategies linked to the increase or decrease in teacher turnover from year-to-year.

**EXHIBIT 3-7
BATH COUNTY PUBLIC SCHOOLS
SAMPLE
EXIT INTERVIEW QUESTIONNAIRE**

EXIT INTERVIEW QUESTIONNAIRE					
<p>Information contained in this questionnaire will be used to improve the administration of personnel policies and procedures. While you are not required to answer any of the following questions, it would be helpful to us if you would take a few minutes to complete this assessment. All responses will be kept strictly confidential</p>					
<p>Name: _____ Position held: _____</p>					
<p>Location: _____ Last day worked: _____</p>					
<p><u>Reason(s) for your separation:</u></p>					
<input type="checkbox"/> Other Employment		<input type="checkbox"/> Temporary Position		<input type="checkbox"/> Rate of Pay	
				<input type="checkbox"/> Benefits	
<input type="checkbox"/> Further Education		<input type="checkbox"/> Retirement		<input type="checkbox"/> Relocation	
<input type="checkbox"/> Health Reasons		<input type="checkbox"/> Personal Reasons		<input type="checkbox"/> Other (please explain) _____	
<p>If relocating, new address: _____</p>					
<p>Please check the appropriate box below:</p>					
	Very Satisfied	Satisfied	Dissatisfied	Very Dissatisfied	No Opinion
Wages					
Advancement Opportunities					
Orientation					
Training					
Hours					
Equipment					
Grievance Procedure					
<p>Comments:</p> <p>_____</p> <p>_____</p>					
<p>Immediate Supervisor: _____</p>					

EXHIBIT 3-7 (Continued)
BATH COUNTY PUBLIC SCHOOLS
SAMPLE
EXIT INTERVIEW QUESTIONNAIRE

Table with 6 columns: Very Satisfied, Satisfied, Dissatisfied, Very Dissatisfied, No Opinion. Rows include: Demonstrates fair treatment, Provides recognition, Provides timely responses to questions, Understands your job duties, Makes you feel your job is important, Makes decisions in a timely manner. Includes open-ended questions: 'If a problem existed with your supervisor, please explain:', 'What did you like the most about your job?', 'What did you like the least about your job?'. Ends with 'Please forward this completed questionnaire to:'.

Source: Stevens Point Area Public School District, Human Resources Division, 2001.

The analysis of turnover is important in the retention of teachers as well as other employees. The division must have viable information to determine what corrections can be made. They need to know why teachers and employees leave (poor morale, dissatisfaction with school administration, teaching overload, relocation, ineptitude, etc.) in order to correct existing problems and to provide incentives to retain and attract teachers and employees to BCPS.

FISCAL IMPACT

This recommendation can be accomplished with existing resources, but will require a minimum of time for staff in the office of instruction and personnel developing the survey and then tabulating results at the end of the school year.

FINDING

Currently, BCPS has employees on payroll that are related to other employees that are in supervisory positions in violation of school board policy. Policy GCCB under *Section G: Personnel* of the BCPS Policy Manual states:

No family member of any employee may be employed by the School Board if the family member is to be employed in a direct supervisory and/or administrative relationship either supervisory or subordinate to the employee. The employment and assignment of family members in the same organizational unit shall be discouraged.

While instances of violations of this school board policy are low or the consultant is not aware of such relationships, the division is creating a situation that leads to unfairness, poor morale, and possible legal ramifications.

Over the past year, one classified employee was promoted into a supervisory position in which the employee has supervision over several family members. Staff told the consultant that the supervisor does not evaluate these family members. However, a supervisory position is just what it implies – supervision over another employee in relation to that person’s work from recording of hours worked, breaks, tasks completed and so on. While no improprieties may result from this practice with the employees in these particular positions, the policy is there to prevent any occurrences from happening.

When MGT conducted its diagnostic study before coming on-site, a comment was made that a “good ole boy network” exists in the division for hiring, resulting in unqualified staff in positions. During the public hearing a similar comment was made in reference to the number of employee related to each other that are hired.

Effective school systems have in place nepotism policies to avoid such occurrences.

RECOMMENDATION

Recommendation 3-9:

Eliminate the practice of assigning employees in supervisory positions over family-related employees.

The division should examine Policy GCCB of *Section G Personnel* and if they intend to override it, then the policy should be rewritten or abolished if not in direct violation of the *Code of Virginia*. MGT strongly urges the division to maintain the policy as is and strictly adhere to policy.

FISCAL IMPACT

This recommendation can be implemented with existing resources.

3.4 Employee Compensation

Rural school divisions often offer salaries much lower than those in urban areas. Particularly affected are new teachers who are facing loans, car payments, and the cost

of living independently. And in some cases salaries of adjoining divisions in rural areas can offer a higher salary making it even more difficult for a division such as BCPS to compete and attract teachers.

Competitive salaries and employee benefits (e.g. sick leave, health, and life insurance and retirement) are thus essential to attracting and retaining highly qualified and competent professional and support staff. Effective salary administration ensures that school district employees are treated equitable and understand how their salaries are determined.

Exhibit 3-8 provides an overview of beginning salaries for teachers, secretaries, aides, food service workers, and custodians. A bus driver's beginning salary as of 2005-06 is around \$15,000. The school division has not established salary scales for bus drivers or administrators.

**EXHIBIT 3-8
BEGINNING SALARIES
TEACHERS, SECRETARIES, AIDES, FOOD SERVICE
WORKERS, AND CUSTODIANS**

EMPLOYEE GROUP	MINIMUM SALARY	MAXIMUM SALARY
Teachers	\$30,794	\$51,294
Secretaries	\$18,333	\$33,733
Aides	\$15,253	\$24,953
Food Service Workers	\$14,275	\$20,075
Custodians	\$15,300	\$24,725

Source: Salary Scales provided by Bath County Public Schools, Office of Instruction and Personnel, April 2006.

FINDING

Non-competitive starting salaries hinder the division's ability to competitively attract teachers to BCPS.

Administrators and teachers were asked in a survey conducted by MGT whether salary levels in BCPS were competitive (Exhibit 3-9). The results were not surprising but when compared to other school districts where the same survey had been conducted, far fewer BCPS administrators and teachers thought salaries were competitive. Only 13 percent of BCPS administrators and 12 percent of BCPS teachers *agree to strongly agree* that salary levels in BCPS are competitive, while in other school districts MGT has surveyed, 41 percent of administrators and 33 percent of teachers *agree to strongly agree* that salary levels in their districts were competitive.

**EXHIBIT 3-9
SURVEY RESPONSES
BATH COUNTY PUBLIC SCHOOLS AND OTHER SCHOOL DISTRICTS**

JOB SATISFACTION	% AGREE OR STRONGLY AGREE / % DISAGREE OR STRONGLY DISAGREE			
	BCPS		OTHER SCHOOL DISTRICTS	
	ADMINISTRATORS/ PRINCIPALS	TEACHERS	ADMINISTRATORS/ PRINCIPALS	TEACHERS
Salary levels in the school district are competitive (with other school districts).	13/38	12/73	41/46	33/53

Source: MGT of America, Inc. BCPS and Other School Districts Survey Results, April 2006.

In Exhibit 3-10, BCPS minimum and maximum teacher salaries are compared to six chosen peer divisions similar in size to BCPS and three neighboring counties (Alleghany, Botetourt, and Highland). Bath County has the third lowest beginning teacher salary (\$30,794) of the nine divisions listed; only Bland and Craig counties salaries (\$27,953 and \$30,316, respectively) are lower. The highest salaries are found in Rappahannock, Richmond, and Surry counties. The neighboring counties of Alleghany, Botetourt, and Highland counties all offer salaries higher than in Bath County (\$31,623, \$32,771, and \$31,600, respectively).

**EXHIBIT 3-10
BENCHMARK TEACHER SALARIES BY SCHOOL DIVISION
2005-06 SCHOOL YEAR**

SCHOOL DIVISION	NUMBER OF STUDENTS	MINIMUM SALARY	STATE RANKING	MAXIMUM SALARY	STATE RANKING
Bath County	783	\$30,794.00	113	\$46,294.00	60
Alleghany County	2,928	\$31,623.00	81	\$47,904.00	102
Bland County	896	\$27,953.00	131	\$44,447.00	124
Botetourt County	4,169	\$32,771.00	71	\$50,157.00	69
Craig County	722	\$30,316.00	119	\$49,428.00	83
Highland County	310	\$31,600.00	98	\$45,600.00	116
Mathews County	1,256	\$31,657.00	95	\$46,104.00	114
Rappahannock County	995	\$33,029.00	66	\$54,453.00	37
Richmond County	1,227	\$33,640.00	57	\$51,840.00	56
Surry County	1,113	\$33,084.00	64	\$53,532.00	45

Source: Virginia Education Association, Inc., 2005-2006 Salary Schedules for Teachers, Volume 1: Benchmarks and Rankings.

Teachers with advanced degrees in BCPS receive \$2,700 if a master's degree is earned, \$2,700 for an Ed.S., and \$3,350 for a doctorate.

BCPS percent increase in minimum salary for teachers is compared to the six divisions in Exhibit 3-11. As shown, Bath County received only a 2.4 percent increase while other school divisions received anywhere from three percent to six percent.

Bringing new teachers to the Warm Springs, Virginia area where neighboring counties of Alleghany, Botetourt, and Highland all offer higher salaries is a challenge for BCPS.

Little in the way of housing and limited social life for a new teacher does not help in the matter.

RECOMMENDATION

Recommendation 3-10:

Analyze beginning teacher salaries in comparison to the competitive market place and make adjustments as budget allows.

**EXHIBIT 3-11
PERCENT INCREASE/DECREASE
IN SCHOOL DIVISIONS MINIMUM SALARIES FROM
2004-05 TO 2005-06**

SCHOOL DIVISION	NUMBER OF STUDENTS	2005-06 SALARY	2004-05 SALARY	INCREASE/DECREASE	
				AMOUNT	PERCENT
Bath County	783	\$30,794.00	\$30,150.00	\$644	2.14%
Bland County	896	\$27,953.00	\$27,139.00	\$814	3.00%
Craig County	722	\$30,316.00	\$30,316.00	\$0	0.00%
Mathew County	1,256	\$31,657.00	\$30,735.00	\$922	3.00%
Rappahannock County	995	\$33,029.00	\$31,546.00	\$1,483	4.70%
Richmond County	1,227	\$33,640.00	\$32,345.00	\$1,295	4.00%
Surry County	1,113	\$33,084.00	\$31,211.00	\$1,873	6.00%

Source: Virginia Education Association, Inc., *2005-2006 Salary Schedules for Teachers*, Volume 1: Benchmarks and Rankings.

Increasing teacher salaries would provide a means to attract and retain quality teachers, which is increasingly becoming a challenge to the division as it faces more retirements in the near future. While the cost to increase current teacher salaries would be significant, the future high turnover rate is as well costly.

The salary committee should undertake the responsibility of assessing all factors related to salary issues such as the cost of raising salaries, the level of increases given the budget, the cost of teacher turnover, the number of teachers that are nearing retirement, and the importance of retaining teachers. When research and discussions are complete, the committee should present a detailed report with accompanying statistical evidence to the school board. As the school board reviews the report and discuss the salary issues, it would be wise to include one or more members of the board of supervisors in the discussions to keep them informed of the division’s needs and helping them understand the rational for increasing salaries if that decision is reached by the school board.

FISCAL IMPACT

The recommendation to analyze beginning teacher salaries can be accomplished with existing resources. However, if the school board decides beginning teacher salary increases are manageable, the cost to the division could be significant as adjustments would need to be made across the teacher salary scale.

However, as an example in estimating a fiscal impact, if the division raised beginning teacher salaries by \$1,500 and hired 10 beginning teachers (number of beginning teachers hired for 2005-06), the fiscal impact to the division would be \$410,130.

Beginning salary of a teacher with no experience	\$ 30,794
Increase in beginning salary	\$ 1,500
Total of proposed beginning salary	\$ 32,294
Plus 27 percent in benefits	\$ 8,719
Total value of new teacher salary	\$ 41,013
Times an estimated hiring of 10 new teachers	\$410,130

This estimate, of course, does not take in consideration the additional monies needed to adjust the entire teacher salary scale for all teachers but is used as an example of how the district could be impacted.

The starting salary of \$32,294 would place Bath County about fifth highest beginning salary of the ten school divisions shown in Exhibit 3-12.

FINDING

BCPS does not have a defined salary schedule for central office or school administrators. Moreover, the BCPS does not have any policies governing the amount of increases that can be given to administrators. Typically, administrative staff other than the superintendent receives a percentage increase that parallels the average teacher scale raises.

Unlike certified and uncertified employees who have defined schedules, administrators are not bound by a set salary schedule. Without a defined administrator's salary schedule, some administrators may receive a higher percentage increase than others do. Some employees, who question this practice, tend to become frustrated. This situation can negatively affect the workplace environment.

Central office administrative salaries range from around \$40,000 to \$67,000. For school administrators, the range is from \$59,000 to \$68,000. No documentation is available that shows beginning salaries for principals and how increases are determined.

Best practices dictate that pay rates and salary ranges for all employees are clearly stated in a salary schedule.

RECOMMENDATION

Recommendation 3-11:

Develop a salary schedule for central office and school administrators and develop policies governing its implementation.

The implementation of this recommendation will not only create equity among all school division employee groups, but it will also assist the superintendent and the Salary Committee with planning and allocating administrative salary increases. An effective practice of a well-managed school includes a division manual that clearly explains the

methodology and guidelines for establishing salaries, salary schedules for all employees, supplementary pay schedules, and any other information pertinent to pay. These documents should be bound together and maintained in the Office of Instruction and Personnel, office of the Business Manager, and the superintendent's office.

The salary scale for administrators and the manual interpreting salary ranges along with salary scales and supplementary pay information should be ready for implementation by January 2007.

FISCAL IMPACT

The initial development of the salary schedule will not create a cost to the school division. The implementation of a new salary schedule may create an additional cost to place administrators on the schedule. The cost of implementing an administrative salary schedule cannot be determined at this time since the plan has not yet been developed.